Common Lottery Board Quarterly Meeting

May 7, 2020
Agenda

- Roll Call
- Vote on February Minutes
- 20-21 Lottery Results + COVID-19 Impacts
- 19-20 MSDC Audit
- Strategic Plan 2020-2024
## Common Lottery Board Roll Call

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Board Member Name</th>
<th>Organization</th>
<th>Present</th>
<th>February Minutes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Paul Kihn</td>
<td>Deputy Mayor for Education</td>
<td>Present</td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Claudia Lujan</td>
<td>DC Public Schools</td>
<td>Present -2:11 Joined after vote</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hilary Darilek</td>
<td>E.L. Haynes</td>
<td>Present</td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Melissa Kim</td>
<td>DC Public Schools</td>
<td>Present -2:11 Joined after vote</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jubria Lewis</td>
<td>The SEED Foundation</td>
<td>Present</td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colin Taylor</td>
<td>DC Public Schools</td>
<td>Present</td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Daniela Anello</td>
<td>DC Bilingual</td>
<td>Present</td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hanseul Kang</td>
<td>Office of the State Superintendent for Education</td>
<td>Present</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lenora Robinson Mills</td>
<td>DC Public Charter School Board</td>
<td>Present</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Catherine Peretti</td>
<td>My School DC</td>
<td>Present</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Lottery for 20-21
Lottery Results at a Glance

- 67% match rate
- +200 students matched vs. 2019
- More students matched to their top choice (~10K)
Total Applications and Results

Matched Applicants | Unmatched Applicants
---|---
2014, Round 1 | 12,262 | 5,070
2015, Round 1 | 14,592 | 5,757
2016, Lottery* | 14,831 | 6,377
2017, Lottery | 14,590 | 7,460
2018, Lottery | 16,089 | 8,907
2019, Lottery | 16,683 | 8,905
2020, Lottery | 16,909 | 8,289

Match Rate:
- 2014, Round 1: 71%
- 2015, Round 1: 72%
- 2016, Lottery*: 70%
- 2017, Lottery: 66%
- 2018, Lottery: 64%
- 2019, Lottery: 65%
- 2020, Lottery: 67%

*Beginning in 2016, there was only one lottery so no Round 1 distinction is needed.
Match Results from 2014 - 2020
SY20-21: Applications and Seats Available

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grade</th>
<th>Applications</th>
<th>Seats Available</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PK3</td>
<td>5,678</td>
<td>6,362</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PK4</td>
<td>3,281</td>
<td>2,239</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>K</td>
<td>2,090</td>
<td>1,442</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>1,185</td>
<td>928</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>1,093</td>
<td>780</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>1,024</td>
<td>803</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>944</td>
<td>737</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>1,343</td>
<td>959</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>2,170</td>
<td>1,941</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>984</td>
<td>503</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>759</td>
<td>336</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>3,584</td>
<td>4,602</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>540</td>
<td>705</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>353</td>
<td>474</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>205</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Achievement Prep MS Closure

• February 14th – MSDC notified that Achievement Prep board voted to close middle school and sent letter to community suggesting automatic enrollment at Friendship
• February 17-21 – MSDC sought clarification of arrangement from PCSB, Achievement Prep and Friendship as it changed
• February 21st – Board Chair Kihn sought legal advice on the issue and input from CLB
• February 27th – Friendship requests to add a new school to MSDC application
• March 2nd - Letter from Board Chair Kihn to Friendship PCS explaining process and denying the late change request to add a new school option at the lottery deadline
• March 9th – PCSB notified DME that Achievement Prep subsequently cancelled their plan for Friendship to open a middle school in Achievement Prep's building
COVID-19 Preparation for Impact
COVID-19 Adjustments

1. The initial enrollment deadline is currently **June 15, 2020**.
   • LEAs can extend waitlist offers before that date ONLY if certain they can honor the offer and serve the student. If there is any question about seat capacity or re-enrollment rates, MSDC recommends waiting before extending any offers.
   • LEAs may not decline any matches if families are unresponsive until June 15th.

2. The **DC Residency Verification Form** can take an e-signature (**see p. 13**) and all supporting documents for residency are now acceptable digitally.

3. The **My School DC Seat Acceptance Form** is now fillable in all six languages and can be accepted digitally with common e-signatures. [Download here](#).

4. The **Universal Health Certificate** and **Oral Health Assessment** are due before the start of school and should not prevent initial enrollments over the spring / summer. [More here](#).
COVID-19 Budget Impact

• FY20 Spending and Hiring Freeze effective April 2020

• FY20 Waivers Requested
  • $160,000 for algorithm update and support contract
  • $200,000 for 20-21 enrollment outreach, creation of 21-22 directories, EdFEST planning

• FY21 Potential Changes
  • $50,000 cut for third party audit, able to do comparisons in-house
  • EdFEST venue and format could change
  • Common Lottery Fund that typically rolls over for MSDC operating funds may be used for COVID-19 response
Anticipated COVID-19 Challenges

1. Schools could be forced to *shrink enrollment* or change the status for newly enrolled students

2. Under-enrolled schools, particularly the new ones, will have extreme *difficulty filling seats*
   - Families may be less likely to start a new school in the COVID environment
   - If any schools *relinquish charters or fail to open* after enrolling students, there is a large manual lift

3. Application *edits and waitlist movement* that typically is spread over months is likely to happen all at once when schools reopen

4. Unreachable families *losing their lottery seats* because of the competing pressure that LEAs have to fill seats. LEAs can use their discretion.
   - LEAs may not have the capacity to go the extra mile to reach families
   - Families may be afraid to go back when schools do reopen
Ten newly opening schools:

Overall, new schools filled 53% of seats they made available.

Range of percentage of seats filled:

- 29%
- 45%
- 45%
- 46%
- 52%
- 55%
- 56%
- 66%
- 73%
- 81%

Lottery deadline was before COVID impact.
Additional Attrition is Expected

19-20 Citywide
37% capture rate overall
(enrollments/offers)
• Matches: 55%
• Waitlist Offers: 29%
MSDC sees declines across applications, offers, and enrollment; largest impact is on enrollments, as schools stand up their online enrollment systems and adapt to COVID-19.

40% decline in post-lottery applications

63% decline in waitlist offers

91% decline in enrollments

Data as of 5/4/2020
MSDC Policies and COVID-19

• The MSDC Policy Guide has been updated to reflect the extended initial enrollment deadline to June 15, 2020
  • Schools can make offers, but cannot decline unresponsive families until that date

• If a school is forced to take away an enrollment because of reduced capacity, charter relinquishment, or delayed opening, the current MSDC policy and practice is to put the formerly enrolled student back onto waitlists they would have been on without the enrollment.
  • Their waitlist position will be determined according to their random lottery number.
  • Some opportunity can be lost if a high-demand school is already at capacity.
  • They may have lost their right to return to their 19-20 school
  • Post-lottery applications and waitlist positions are first-come, first-served
Audit for 19-20
AIR Statement of Work

• Identify participating schools that enrolled students outside of the My School DC process

• Analyze requested lottery grades and enrolled lottery grades of applicants

• Analyze enrollment error trends in the SY19-20 lottery and the Centralized Waitlist Management System (“CWMS”) usage

KEY SY19-20 FINDINGS

• Large decrease in errors overall across all categories
  • Continued technical assistance to LEAs, added an early audit with DCPS
  • Displacement "categories" estimate whether a student enrolled while others were on the waitlist

• Uptick in grade level discrepancies, driven by increase in PK errors and a technical issue

• Gap persists between timely at-risk and non at-risk application submissions
  • 60% of at-risk applications submitted applications before the deadline compared to 80% of non at-risk applications

• 85% of lottery applicants received a match or waitlist offer by October
39% decrease in citywide errors from 18-19; 90% decrease from first year

*Prior to 2016-17, “enrolled without offers” was not counted as an error; these values are the lower bound for the true error numbers
Errors decreased across all displacement categories

- **No displacement**: 321 (2017-18) vs. 316 (2018-19) vs. 193 (2019-20)
  - 39% decrease in overall errors vs. 18-19 (90% vs. 14-15)

- **Potential displacement** (waitlist < 5)
  - 321: 35 (2017-18) vs. 32 (2018-19)
  - 316: 63 (2018-19) vs. 140 (2019-20)
  - **Change vs. 18-19**
    - -53%
    - -65%
    - -10%

- **Likely displacement** (waitlist ≥ 5)
  - 321: 223 (2017-18) vs. 144 (2018-19) vs. 129 (2019-20)
  - **Change vs. 18-19**
    - -53%
    - -65%
    - -10%
Grade Discrepancies:
Increase driven by PK errors

Historic count of grade discrepancies

Number of applicants

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grade</th>
<th>2015-16</th>
<th>2016-17</th>
<th>2017-18</th>
<th>2018-19</th>
<th>2019-20</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PK</td>
<td>521</td>
<td>330</td>
<td>287</td>
<td>392</td>
<td>519</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PK3</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>132</td>
<td>112</td>
<td>112</td>
<td>112</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2019-20 discrepancies by application grade

- Other grades: 132
- PK4: 52
- 11th grade: 65
- PK3: 112
- 10th grade: 158
Gap between timely at-risk and non at-risk application submissions persists

60% of at-risk applicants submit before the 2019 lottery deadline

Compared to 61% in 2018

80% of non at-risk applicants submit before the 2019 lottery deadline

VS.

Total applicants include all applicants between lottery opening and October 31, 2019; excludes any applicants whose USI or at-risk information could not be identified
Offer rate increases to 85%

21,645 lottery applicants in the 19-20 school year received a match or an eventual waitlist offer(s) by October.
MSDC Strategic Plan 2020-2024
Survey Results: 2020-2024 focus

POTENTIAL FOCUS AREAS
(in PAC rank order – no difference from CLB)

1. End-to-end integrated and **digital enrollment**
2. Increasing access to more schools using **lottery preferences**
3. **Personalized outreach** to families
4. Doing more to **support SPED students**
5. Publishing more **research and data for planning**

ADDITIONAL CONSIDERATIONS

Potential challenges to areas of focus:

- May be **difficult to reach families new to the area** and unfamiliar with lottery
- **Willingness of LEAs** to publicly publish relevant data
- Incorporation of digital systems with **DCPS non-lottery enrollments** can be challenging
- **Family access to technology** to allow for digital enrollment

Additional suggestions:

- Aid in **reducing proliferation of low performing schools** that duplicate existing models
- More **parent-facing articles** of what things to look for when applying for the lottery
- Provide data about the lottery process and access to families as a **means to drive policy**
Discuss: School Planning Data

MSDC can provide both historic benchmarks and real-time application and offer data to support planning and approvals of new school openings.

**LOTTERY APPLICATIONS**

Benchmarks:
- Median applications-to-match ratio
- Median applications-to-seats ratio to fill all lottery seats by grade
- Median applications submitted per campus by grade

**POST-LOTTERY APPLICATIONS**

Benchmarks:
- Median post-lottery-to-lottery application ratio by grade
- Median % of total enrollments filled by post-lottery applications by grade & ward

**MATCH AND WAITLIST OFFER CAPTURE RATES**

Benchmarks:
- Historic offer conversion rate by grade

Comparison of real-time data against benchmarks can help to create ongoing “risk profiles” for each new school to meet enrollment target.
Planning Data: Example lottery period assessment

School X data and assumptions:
- Target full PK3 enrollment: 60 students
- Target matched PK3 enrollment: 40 students
- Lottery applications received: 200

Applications to matches ratio

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Applications to matches ratio</th>
<th>Conservative: 5:1</th>
<th>Base: 3:1</th>
<th>Aggressive: 2:1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Match capture rate</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conservative: 25%</td>
<td>10 enrolled</td>
<td>17 enrolled</td>
<td>25 enrolled</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Base: 40%</td>
<td>16 enrolled</td>
<td>27 enrolled</td>
<td>40 enrolled</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aggressive: 55%</td>
<td>22 enrolled</td>
<td>37 enrolled</td>
<td>55 enrolled</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Discuss: New Preference Modeling

MSDC can use Stevens pilot for future preference planning and modeling:

• At-risk preference for charter schools, legislation introduced in March
• Military preference for charter school on Bolling AFB, legislated already

DC Policy Center conducted research on at-risk preference designs for 12 interested public charter schools
At-Risk Preference at Stevens ELC

**Late Summer 2019**
Began holding weekly meetings with DCPS to determine the parameters and process

**Fall and Winter**
Collaborated with DCPS to create:
- Process documents and preference definition
- Standard operating procedures
- Consistent parent facing language

**Early Spring**
Implemented process through the running of the lottery and post-lottery
Discuss: Online Enrollment and Registration

- LEAs are currently encouraged to stand up online enrollment procedures
- MSDC can partner with OSSE's Office and Enrollment and Residency to learn from the process during COVID-19 adaptation
Discuss: Parent-facing content and help

- Are there parent-facing articles we can write for families of students with disabilities (SWD)?
- Can we create a subpage on the My School DC website like we did for applicants to PK3 for any other subgroups?
- Can we do more to partner with organizations that work directly with SWD?
Appendix
Lottery for 20-21
## SY20-21 Newly Opening Schools

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School Name</th>
<th>Sector</th>
<th>Grades Served</th>
<th>Ward</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AppleTree Early Learning PCS – Southwest</td>
<td>Charter</td>
<td>PK3 – PK4</td>
<td>Ward 6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Capital Village PCS</td>
<td>Charter</td>
<td>Grades 5-6</td>
<td>Ward 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cesar Chavez Parkside MS</td>
<td>Charter</td>
<td>Grade 6</td>
<td>Ward 7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DC Prep PCS – Anacostia Middle</td>
<td>Charter</td>
<td>Grade 4</td>
<td>Ward 8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Girls Global Academy PCS</td>
<td>Charter</td>
<td>Grade 9</td>
<td>Ward 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I Dream PCS</td>
<td>Charter</td>
<td>PK3</td>
<td>Ward 7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rocketship Fort Totten PCS</td>
<td>Charter</td>
<td>PK3 – Grade 2</td>
<td>Ward 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stevens Early Learning Center</td>
<td>DCPS</td>
<td>PK3 – PK4</td>
<td>Ward 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Justice PCS</td>
<td>Charter</td>
<td>Grades 5-6</td>
<td>Ward 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Sojourner Truth PCS</td>
<td>Charter</td>
<td>Grades 6-7</td>
<td>Ward 5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Offer and Enrollment Activity

- **2020 Activity to 5/4/2020**
- **2019 Waitlist Offers**
- **2019 Enrollments**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Month</th>
<th>2019 Offers</th>
<th>2019 Enrollments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>March</td>
<td>347</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>April</td>
<td>6646</td>
<td>3117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>May</td>
<td>9065</td>
<td>6068</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>June</td>
<td>5357</td>
<td>2064</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>July</td>
<td>5679</td>
<td>2262</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>August</td>
<td>6873</td>
<td>2666</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>September</td>
<td>5538</td>
<td>1566</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>October</td>
<td></td>
<td>947</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
MSDC Strategic Plan 2020-2024
Survey Results: Current State

Overall agreement with MSDC purpose
“Operates a common application, common lottery and outreach program for all public schools of choice in DC.”

Alignment across MSDC staff, Common Lottery Board, and PAC members on order of successfuless across MSDC focus areas

**LEARN**
- Facilitate access to school info and lottery process info

**APPLY**
- Operate common application and lottery

**ENROLL**
- Coordinate to improve enrollment processes

**PLAN**
- Analyze lottery impacts & inform planning

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PAC</th>
<th>CLB</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>86%</td>
<td>67%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Survey Results: Role of CLB

Respondents felt the **CLB has been most successful in promoting LEA participation**

**Effectiveness**

- **Promote participation of LEAs** in the common lottery system

- **Adopt policies and procedures** to govern the common lottery system

- Develop a **5-year strategic plan** for continuous improvement

- Solicit **input from the PAC**

- Develop an **annual budget**

- Identify critical entities with which to **partner**

**Agreement to continue meeting quarterly**

- **Agree:** 67%
- **Disagree:** 33%

**Agreement to conduct joint annual meeting with PAC**

- **Agree:** 67%
- **Disagree:** 33%
The preference design effectively reserved 33 seats for at-risk students. 26 students have received the at-risk preference to date, resulting in 17 matches or waitlist offers.

MSDC-DAR feed was able to match USIs for almost half the applicants. 47% of applicants had matching USIs.

Many Stevens applicants are unlikely to have USIs due to no prior enrollment in a DC public school – all can appeal preference status.

100% of non-at-risk seats filled (with a waitlist) and 33% of at-risk seats filled in the lottery.

26 students have received the at-risk preference, resulting in 17 matches or waitlist offers.

6 post-lottery applicants to-date have been identified as eligible.

- All applicants (L & PL) checked against DAR feed weekly for updates
- All PL applicants identified thus far have been through the MSDC-DAR feed
- No applicants have appealed to receive the preference, yet...